



## Afghanistan; **Informal vs Formal Governance** In the land of yaghestan (پاغیستان) **Vern Liebl June 2018**



#### Accounting for Informal Governance?













Are we looking at the right things? Is Afghanistan's problems ours?



### **People of Afghanistan**



- Official population estimate is 36.3 million (2018)
- Lots of "Estimated Population Statistics":
  - Religion: 99% Muslim, ~1% Other (Hindu, Zoroastrian, etc)
  - Muslim Sects: 80-85% Sunni, 14.5-19.5% Shia, other .5%
  - Sex: 51.7% male, 48.3% female
  - Language: 50% Dari, 35% Pashto, 11% Uzbek & Turkmen, 4% Baloch/Other
  - Location: 74% rural, 26% urban
  - Life Expectancy: 51 years
  - Infant Mortality Rate: 10%
  - Literacy: 38.2% overall (52% male, 24.2% female)







### Afghanistan's Ethnic Mosaic



- Diverse Population & Estimated Statistics:
- Pashtuns @ ~44% (Hanafi Sunni)
- Tajiks @ ~33% (Hanafi Sunni, Shia)
- Hazaras @ ~10% (Shia Imamiyya & Ismaili)
- Turkmen@ : ~2% (Hanafi Sunni)
- Uzbeks @ ~6%(Hanafi Sunni)
- Aimaq @ ~3% (Hanafi Sunni, Shia)
- Other (Baluchi/ Brahui, Farsiwan, Nuristani, Qizilbash, Pashai) @ ~2% (Hanafi Sunni, Shia, Ismaili, Hindu/Sikh)
- Last population census: 1979 15.5 million (estimated 2.5 million Kuchis) Afghans, current <u>estimate</u> 34 to 37 million ("official UN estimate" for 2018 is 36,340,526)
- Afghans: ~15 million Pashtuns,



#### Afghanistan's Ethnic Mosaic







#### **The Bigger Picture - Ethnicity**

CED OPERATIONA

CAOCI

STATES MARINE

CENTER FOR





#### **Geography of Afghanistan**





The mountains and deserts isolate



#### Its All About Resources Zar, Zan, Zameen



Zar, Zan and Zameen are described in an old Afghan proverb as the central facts of life in Afghanistan, which underlies most of the violence which permeates Afghan culture

Zar is gold, which represents the power to obtain things, like weapons, which is a source of power



Zan is women, which represents the ability to give birth to more Afghan men in order to make more warriors, another source of power

Zameen is land, which represents the ability to both control territory as well as grow food, both sources of power





#### Afghanistan's Ethnic/Tribal Organization



This presentation almost exclusively addresses the Pashtuns, as these will primarily be the Afghans we meet, observe or interact with; however, the other ethnic groups generally organize as follows:

- Tajiks (regionally vice tribally) Panjsheri, Badakhshi, Samangani, Andarabi – far more amenable to central governance
- Hazara (tribally) Behsud, Daikundi, Daichopan, Qalandar, Jaghori, Uruzgani, Poladha – more amenable to central governance
- Uzbeks (weakened tribal, primarily ethnic) Qipchak, Mangit, Burqut, Khitay, Saray, Uch Uruk – more amenable to central governance
- Baloch (subtribes of) Mengal, Bughti, Marri not amenable at all to central governance, as independent as the Pushtuns



# All Governance Begins at the Village (Deh/Qarya) Level



- Out of an estimated population of more than 36 million, more than threequarters (estimated 26-28 million) of the Afghan people live in rural areas
- Afghanistan is a mountainous piece of land at the heart of Asia. The geography of the country has divided the nation into hundreds of individual communities living apart from each other in barely accessible valleys, basins and hills
- The challenge of keeping the nation under one leader/govt has been a constant political effort for every historical ruler of the country
- Recent lessons learned from decades of war have drastically affected most Afghan's way of thinking on internal developments of Afghanistan
- People appear to be no longer willing to be governed under the same rules and regulations that former rulers applied
- Most ordinary rural individuals seem to be very well aware of the broader consequences of the decisions they make for their own small farms



#### **Informal Governance Factors**



#### The Afghan Family

- Endogamous with parallel and cross-cousin marriages preferred
- Patriarchal authority vested in the male elders
- Patrilineal inheritance thru the male line
- Patrilocal female moves to husband's place of residence on marriage
- Polygyny multiple wives
- Extended families characterized by residential unity
- Extended kinship networks endow the family as the primary support system in society vice government

#### Tribal Elements

- Tribal Commitment Before Personal Interest
- Obeying a More Senior Tribal Kin is Expected
- A Tribe Must Maintain Tribal Honor (Nang) at all Costs
- Tribal Law (Pashtunwali via Jirgas) to Solve Disputes With Others; if Unresolved Leads to Blood Feud/Violence (see Narkh, meaning customary legal norms)
- Tribes, if They Accept the Obligation, Will Protect Those Whom They Grant Sanctuary











## Key players in the village power game











Chakbashi - Village agricultural specialist





Village elders – Spingeri, Mashran, Jalasa, Maraka, Rish Safidan, Qawmi Shura, Meshrano jirga, Muye Safidan, Og Soqol: village-based council which varies from place to place, generally a deliberative body that executes through the village leader



Mullah - Village Religious leader (usually "judges or instructs" via Adat/Rawaj, 'customary law')

Mirab - Village water master



Shawunkei/Malim -Village teacher, as with the Mullah, hired by the village leader

Qarya Dar - District appointed village headman, usually the village leader



Qomandar - Village "militia" commander



#### How The Afghan Villager Sees It



- Afghans living at the village/rural level, in their efforts to positively affect their own participation in governance basically have boiled it down to two motivating factors
- These two determinants are Islam and economic gain, so given these two determinants, only two sets of policies can serve the interest of rural people:
  - Islamic-based governance policies and village-based economic policies
- Obviously, any political party that best accommodates the village with more of these two incentives will eventually gain more political support
- Therefore, political parties in the eyes of the Helmand villager are divided into two major categories:
  - > 1) Islamic Parties vs. Non-Islamic parties
  - > 2) Pro-rural economy parties vs. pro-urban economy parties
- In the villages Afghans use a very specific terminology for each of these groups:
  - \* "Khadem-e-Deen wa Dushman-e-Deen", basically servant of the religion vs. enemy of the religion
  - "Mardomdar wa Nektayeedar", which means populists vs. necktie owners



#### The Qawm





• Much of Afghan society is structured in "qawm" (tribes), which has taken an international dimension over the past 30 years of war and disaster

• The "qawm" has had a dual effect in Afghanistan's history; on the one hand it has prevented the central government 's promotion of modernity while on the other hand it has been the crucial "social capital" providing societal resilience to the external shocks of war, natural disaster and failed governance

• However, shaped by this "qawm," Afghan society is a "fragmented network society" which has resulted in poor "socio-political" representation of its members



#### As an Example: Structure of Pashtun Tribes



- Qawm
- Tabar
- Khel
- Khel/Plarina
- Kahol
- Koranay



- Tribe
- Subtribe
- Clan
- Subclan
- Extended family group
- Cellular family

The family, the basis for society, honor and trust

Itibar - Trust which means trust, or اعتبار guaranteed assurance, is the arch of society, which is governed by unwritten laws or convention. All business including contracts relating to sale and mortgage or disposal of the property, is transacted on the basis of trust or *itibar*. Such transactions are verbal and are entered into in the presence of the village elders or a few witnesses. The violation of *itibar* is considered a dishonorable act, one unbecoming of a gentleman and contrary to the norms of Pashtunwali.



#### "Pushtunwali"



Pushtunwali literally means 'the way of the Pushtuns', a tribal honor code that has governed the Pushtun way of life for centuries; although it pre-dates Islam the two have become inseparable for many Pushtuns, even though *in practice* Pushtunwali codes often contradict the Qur'an

- <u>Core Principles</u> and Tenets of the Pashtunwali are based on Nang/Ghairat (Honor – formally/informally):
- Malmastia (Hospitality)
- Nanawati (Surrender/Forgiveness)
- Panah kawal (Asylum, see Nanawati)
- Nyaw aw Badal (Revenge/Exchange)
- Zamaka (the protection of one's land or property)
- Turah (Bravery, literally means "sword")
- Namus (Honor concerning women, protect them from harm)
- Nang (Honor, to defend the weak)





#### Pushtunwali on Dispute Resolution



- Given the historical lack of central government in Afghanistan, disputes between two Parties were – and still are – settled according to tribal law, or *narkh*
- The first step in resolving the dispute involves getting both parties to grant authority ((حاك wak) to the mediating body (مركه maraka, for smaller cases, or جرگ jirga, for more important issues; both are usually composed of elders uninvolved in the dispute)
- The maraka or jirga will collect two sums from the disputants: khalaat (خلات)[sp?], a fee for the mediators, and برمته baramta, a deposit (which is usually weapons or cash) made by both parties as a sign of good faith that they will accept the mediators' decision
- If either party to the dispute refuses to accept the decision of the *maraka* or *jirga*, they forfeit the deposit
- Words to know and understand:
  - > maraka: discussion, a smaller jirga usually held at the family or intra-clan (khel) level
  - *wak*: power, authority
  - jirga: council, literally circle, normally used for major issues at the inter-clan or tribe level, involving murder, rape or serious land issues
  - > Narkhis: men in society or in tribes who understand the rules of Narkh (heavily based on precedent)



#### Shura versus Jirga

- The jirga, a word meaning circle and thus emphasizing the complete equality of all Pashtun men, will be conducted by men that have authority to settle a dispute in a way acceptable to the disputants
- It is held in an open public place, often a graveyard among the tribe's ancestors, and there is no chairman, again to emphasize equality despite social standing, power or wealth of some of the participants
- A jirga can also simply be a village council but is still run as above
- The shura, on the other hand and depending on who runs it, is different and has three entirely different meanings and intent







#### Shura versus Jirga



- From a religious perspective, a shura is a consultative council convened by a religious authority
- Alternatively, the second meaning of shura in Afghanistan is the adoption of GIRoA of the term to describe formal governance mechanisms at the provincial and district levels
- The third meaning is simply a village council (see jirga/maraca/jalasa)
- It is important to not confuse the terms shura and jirga, principally in ethnic Pashtun areas
- What makes the issue even more confusing is that non-Pashtuns in Afghanistan, who understand the meaning of jirga, will themselves use the term shura for jirga











#### "Informal" Jirga Enforcement Mechanisms



- The Jirga, as a community-based process for collective decision-making and dispute settlement, can impose sanctions by using "tribal forces" to enforce its decisions
- Arbakai, generally the tribal "police force" (if a member of the Arbakai is harmed, the offender is usually killed or crippled)



- Tsalweshtai, generally a tribal/village security force limited in scope and number (if a member of the Tsalweshtai kills someone while in the performance of his duty, there is no blood feud)
- Chaga, a small force raised within a village to respond to robbery, animal rustling, banditry, etc. (as with the Tsalweshtai, there is no blood feud outcome)
- Chalweshtai is larger than a Tsalweshtai, maybe be used similar as an Arbakai but may also undertake community projects such as canal maintenance, dam building or community policing of inter-village roads.
- Lashkar, a much larger group raised to deal with regional issues 9to include revolt against the central government or jihad)



#### Some Other Tribal Codes of Afghanistan



The Baluchmayar guides and influences the life of individuals and determines the future of Baluch society (These traditions are completely different from the traditions of the Muslims of South Asia and the Persians of Iran)

The Baluch traditions are known by each person from his youth and the following, in brief, are its major tenets:

- Ber/Hun Revenge (avenging of blood)
- Mehmani Hospitality (obligation to protect all guests)
- Meir Pardoning (an offense is pardoned by a woman)
- Kamzor-o-lachor Protect the weak (Zal, Bachh, Ghuleral, Lori, Nakib)
- Amanat/Etbar Trust
- Qaul Promise
- Shigen Taunting)

The Turkmenchilik, which means Turkmenness, is composed of three congruent codes, which are:

- Adat Turkmen customary law
- Edep Turkmen standards of behavior and etiquette
- Sherigat Islamic Law

The Uzbekchilik, which means Uzbekness, is combined with elements of shamanism but observes most tenets of the Pushtunwali via forced colonization



#### Manteqa, or "Area"



- In addition to "qawm", the place/region where a person comes from/lives, or the "manteqa," is another element shaping identity and solidarity in Afghanistan
- The "manteqa" is the actual social and territorial unit of rural Afghanistan, commonly a "manteqa" is composed of several villages or cluster of villages where solidarity is shaped among the local population
- These "manteqa" do not have any administrative recognition, although traditional structures/committees exist at the "manteqa" level (i.e. "shura-e manteqa", "rish safedan-e manteqa", "nomayendagan-e manteqa" or "shura-e mahali")
- The "manteqa" and their committee are the missing interactive links between the district administration and the village
- A manteqa can be large or very small



A micro-example of manteqa, of area community, working to keep a bridge from washing away



Rehabilitating an irrigation gate



#### The Manteqa : Water Management Examples



Wakil and mirab-bashi (regional)

overall management;

□ conflict resolution;

□ scheduling annual maintenance;

□coordinating hashar (communal unpaid labour);

□ collection of annual contributions;

□ coordinating emergency response; and

external coordination

Mirab and chakbashi (manteqa)

□management of branch water allocation and rotation;

coordinating annual maintenance; and

□ conflict resolution

*Mirab* and *chakbashi* (qarya/district) managing system operation;

□supervising annual maintenance;

supervising construction works; and

□ collection of annual contributions

Zamindar/Mirab Canal Committee (village) management of water allocation; and provision of hashar labour for maintenance



Karez maintenance



Hashar – Afghan community labor coordinated by Mirabs



#### Ali Abad District: Blending Example Gone Bad



- The Mirab system in Ali Abad district, Kunduz Province, had been a well functioning water management system in the recent past, from the time of Zahir Shah until the fall of the Taliban (1940s-1990s); it does not function now
- Two reasons were identified by local inhabitants why it functioned well: firstly the Mirabs of that time where seen as virtuous men, and secondly, in the past the Mirab had external enforcement capacity
- During Zahir Shah's time until the fall of the Najibullah regime, the Mirab had the full support of the government
- During the Rabbani regime, mutual fear between the upstream and downstream communities, all heavily armed, served as a basis for enforcement capacity of the Mirab



- During the Taliban era a combination of the two above mentioned reasons, served as the basis of enforcement capacity of the Mirab
- Currently the Mirab's do not enjoy such support from the government in practice and the same degree of fear of a bloody conflict does not exist
- This has resulted in the farmers not taking the Mirab seriously, and there is nothing the Mirab can do to change their minds

Ali Abad is a very mixed district – Pasthuns 30%, Uzbeks 30%, Tajiks 20%, Hazara 20%



#### **The Mosque Network**



- In Afghanistan, mosques play a critical role in the day-to-day lives of Afghan people
- Mosques are the center of the community/village, and village size is often expressed in the number of mosques it contains
- When a message comes out of the mouth of the religious leader inside the mosque, it receives enormous attention and motivates people to pay special attention to that message
- Most of these mosques are linked into what can be called a network, which extends across all formal governmental boundaries
- This network of mosques has existed for centuries and even in recent history has been or is still used by many different politicians to mobilize ordinary villagers of Afghanistan for different wars
- In every instance the key role was/is played by the religious leaders (Mullahs)
- This is probably one of the reasons why the absence of any government role was rarely felt by the rural people of Afghanistan, even when governments collapsed or changed



Village mosque, Qal'eh-ye Sefid, Kabul province



#### Governance "Balance of Power"



- Formal leaders (examples)
  - President
  - Provincial Governor
  - District Governor
  - Police Chief
- Informal leaders (examples)
  - Khan (head of a sub-tribe or village(s))
  - Malik/Zamindar/Arbab (head of a sub-tribe, clan or village)
  - Mullah (religious leader)







#### Governance: Formal Government Structures



- Afghanistan's formal government structure is designed around what is supposed to be a strong, democratic national government
- At the national level, the three branches (Executive, Legislative, and Judicial) form the foundation of the government, but other entities, such as ministries, the Afghan National Security Forces (military and police), and commissions also carry out government obligations
- Designed actually to have the President be powerful with weak legislature and judiciary
- Kabul, the capital, is the seat of power
- Each province answers to the national government, governors have little real power



- Executive Branch President
- Legislative branch
  National Assembly
  - Wolesi Jirga (House of the People)
  - Meshrano Jirga (House of Elders)
- Judicial Branch Supreme Court



#### New Unity Government (NUG) of Afghanistan (GIRoA)





- Compromise dual-headed executive position brokered by U.S. in Sep 2014
- Ashraf Ghani (Pashtun) is President, Abdullah Abdullah (Tajik) is Chief Executive Officer
- Two political opponents with irreconcilable differences has brought executive governance to a stand-still





### **National Legislative Branch**





The Wolesi Jirga (House of the People)

- The National Assembly, also known as the Afghan Parliament, is Afghanistan's national legislature
- It is a bicameral body, comprising two chambers:
  - *Meshrano Jirga (*House of Elders), an upper house with 102 seats
  - Wolesi Jirga (House of the People), a lower house with 250 seats



The Meshrano Jirga (House of Elders)

Elections to the Jirgas scheduled for June 2016 have been delayed three times to October 2018





## **The National Judiciary Branch**



Independent branch of the Government Consist of the following:

A.Supreme court (Stera Mahkama)

Highest court of the land
 B.High courts

C.Appeal courts

- Key components of Supreme Court:
  - Nine members
    - Chief Justice Sayed Yousuf Halim
    - Appointed by the President
  - Approved by Wolesi Jirga
  - Ten year term (not lifetime)
  - One term appointments
  - President appoints one among them as Head of Supreme Court
  - Members can't be dismissed till end of term
  - If crimes are committed, more then 1/3 of Wolesi Jirga must demand the trial/impeachment







#### Governance: Formal Government Structures

- Afghanistan's Constitution outlines a unitary state where all political authority is vested in the government in Kabul
- The sub-national government structure consists of provinces, municipalities, districts, and villages
- The central government ministries and institutions retain authority over these structures, primarily through their control of the budget, which they apportion to the provincial ministries
- Below the national level, the public sector consists of provincial-level governments, municipalities, and finally district-level government
- However, unlike the U.S. government, each of the 34 provinces (*wilayats*) does not operate independently of the national government





Afghan Parliament building in Kabul





#### **CABINET MINISTERS**

#### (Executive Branch)



Minister of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock Minister of Border, Tribal and Ethics Affairs Minister of Communications and Information Technology Minister of Commerce and Industries Minister of Counter-Narcotics Minister of Defense Minister of Economy Minister of Education Minister of Higher Education Minister of Energy and Water Minister of Finance Minister of Foreign Affairs Ministry of Hajj and Islamic Affairs Minister of Information and Culture Minister of Interior Minister of Justice Minister of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and Disabled Minister of Mines Minister of Public Health Minister of Public Works Minister of Refugees and Repatriations Minister of Rural Rehabilitation and Development Minister of Transportation and Civil Aviation Minister Of Urban Development Affairs Minister of Woman's Affairs

- 25 Cabinet members/Ministers
  - At least 35 years of age
- Generally highly educated
- Appointed by the President and approved by the Wolesi Jirga





#### **Provincial Governance**



Provincial Governor selected by President but appointed by Ministry of Interior

Every Province must form a provincial council Members:

- ¼ must be women
- Elected proportionate to the population
  - 500,000 or less
    - 9 members council
  - 500,000 to 1 Million
    - 15 members council
  - 1 Million to 2 Million
    - 19 members council
  - 2 Million to 3 Million
    - 23 members council
  - 3 Million & more
    - 29 members council

4 years term

Chairman - elected from among the council members



Helmand Provincial Governor Mohammad Yasin Khan - 2018



JALALABAD ,Nov 8, 2009 : Independent Election Commission (IEC) officials recount ballots for provincial council candidates in the eastern province of Nangarhar province



#### Provincial Courts Rule of Law



The Court of Appeals:

- The Court of Appeals is established in all the provinces in accordance with the Constitution
- The Court of Appeals is composed of chief of the court, heads of Dewans and other judicial members
- Head of the Court of Appeals shall be selected from among the judges who have enough qualification, experience and competency
- Head of the General Criminal Dewan is the deputy head of court of appeals

Structure of Dewans of Courts of Appeal: The Courts of Appeal contains the following Dewans:

- General Criminal Dewan
- Public Security Dewan
- Civil and Family Dewan
- Public Rights Dewan
- Commercial Dewan
- Juveniles Dewan







#### **District Governance**

Current Garmsir District Governor Mohammad Ayoub Omar

- All District governors selected by the President and appointed by the Ministry of Interior
- District Councils:



- Most elections postponed due to unresolved district boundary disputes
- Members: Elected thru free and direct elections for 3 years term
- Purpose: Provide an avenue for locals to actively participate in the local politics
- Municipalities (in many ways to be considered similar to Districts): Purpose: Administer city affairs
  - Mayor: Depending on size, smaller ones can elected the mayor via free and direct elections in each cities; larger municipalities (such as Lashkar Gah in Helmand or Zaranj in Nimroz), mayor's are appointed by the President





#### District Courts Rule of Law



**District Primary Court Structure:** 

- The District primary court shall consist of a chief and two members. In the areas where there are no members available, the cases shall be decided by fewer than three
- The chief of the district primary court shall lead the court
- In his/her absence, the responsibilities and powers shall be transferred to the most judicially experienced judge on the court

Registration of documents and deeds branches:

- In the structure of every Court of Appeals, there is a Directorate of Documents and Deeds Registration (DDDR)
- Registration of commercial documents and trade marks shall be the jurisdiction of the commercial court



Lack of supervision can lead to abuse or "reversion" of judicial system to earlier-type "justice"





#### The Islamic Emirate of Afghanistan





- Where Taliban is or has been in control, at the village level the village headman is supplanted by the Mullah as village leader
- If the current Mullah is insufficiently pro-Taliban, he is replaced



Mawlawi Habitullah Akhundzada, from Panjwayi, Kandahar – is a Nurzai Pashtun Mawlawi can also be spelled Maulvi, Moulvi, etc, which means a religious scholar, senior to a Mullah



#### The Taliban as a "Statelet"? Shadow vs Real Governance



- The Taliban currently control parts of the country (example: most of Helmand Province) and have been making significant attacks elsewhere
- As of February 2018, it was estimated the Kabul government controls 54% of Afghanistan, the Taliban 17% with the remaining 29% contested
- Using population numbers, that means: the government controls ~19 million people, Taliban controls ~3.5 to 4 million people and ~9 million people are in contested areas
- In addition, Taliban actively governs and taxes the areas it controls, as well as conducting international trade (mostly via Pakistan)





#### Taliban Governance



- The Taliban's shadow government is in principle mimicking the Kabul government's structure; hence the Taliban have a power distribution department even if all it does is collect payments for electricity delivered by Kabul's power department
- The Agriculture Commission for example is largely idle, and its staff members reportedly are assigned other tasks, such as writing up threat letters on behalf of the Taliban's intelligence department
- Only a relatively few of the Taliban's Commissions and Departments therefore have genuine activities inside Afghanistan:
  - The Local Commissions: manage provincial and district governors, (district governors primarily handle day to day relations with community elders
  - The Justice Commissions: manage systems of courts at the district level
  - The Education Commissions: fund and manage a network of madrasas in Afghanistan, deploy cadres to monitor the activities of state schools, pay teachers to carry out propaganda work for the Taliban, etc.
  - The Health Commission: Apart from supporting the Taliban combat units with medics and doctors, also maintains some clinics open to some villagers
  - The Companies Commissions: tax all economic activities.
  - The NGO Commissions: regulate humanitarian and development access
  - The Ulema Commissions: pay salaries to pro-Taliban clerics



#### Tribal Conflict – Transformational?



- Tribal conflict best example is the Kakar tribe (with 20 distinct sub-tribes) ongoing conflict with the Alikozai tribe (primarily in Sangin District, Helmand
- The Kakar, part of the Gurgusht confederation, aim to supplant the Alikozai from Sangin and possibly from Alikozai-populated areas of the Arghandab in Kandahar
- The Alikozai are Durrani, related to the Barakzai, Popalzaiand Alikozai, also but not as closely to the Alizai, Nurzai and Ishaqzai
- The Alikozai are rivals of the Barakzai and Popalzai, known as the "Keeper of the Tribal Balance of Power" by other tribes (think Devil's Advocates)
- Alikozai subtribes have been forcibly displaced in the past
- Kakar are noted for being powerful and opportunistic, are primarily in Pakistan Balochistan and parts of Kandahar province in Afghanistan
- Kakar are frequently considered low-status
- Many allied with Taliban, several noted Taliban commanders are/were Kakars
- This is an "informal war"



#### Competing Factors To Contemplate



- Feudal Obligations example, the Haqqani Organization
- Diminution of Kuchi movement and strengthening of Hazara self-protection (invalidation of Kuchi [Pashtun] use of Hazara pasturage, shifting rural structures)
- Village Mullah culture (see Taliban) versus governmentcertified Mullah program (think Burhanuddin Rabbani – attended Al Azhar University, assassinated by Taliban)
- Islamic State-Khorasan Province impact
- Pakistan India Proxy Conflict
- Influence of Opium (criminality)
- Influence of modern farming techniques (i.e., tractors)
- Destructive legacies impact of state centralization policies of Daud Khan, the People's Democratic Party of Afghanistan, the Soviet Union, the Mujahideen period and follow-on NGO, National Solidarity Program, PRT and CDC "centralization" efforts









#### **Any Questions?**



